

Danielle Bustillo

**A COMPILATION
OF TANGENTS
ON SURVEILLANCE, ANONYMITY AND
DECEPTION TACTICS.**

This has been written, revised, and considered with thanks to the endless supply of information from my mentors Tom Leeser and Tom Jennings; alongside the brilliance of Joey Cannizzaro, around conversations and comments from Adam Feldmeth, rigorous edits and suggestions from Jen Hutton and Chris Brown. Parts of this thesis were developed on a draft email I share with an artist collective *neverhitsend*.

Part I Dataveillance: Negotiating Consent

“By order, two plus two equals five, and the tortured individual sees five fingers when four are held up before him.”

—The Interposed Body: George Orwell’s Nineteen Eighty-Four, Claude Lefort,
Writing The Political Test.



The banality of surveillance and of its critique is inevitable. Its design accounts for its inverse; it anticipates and inhabits contradictions imperative to providing an illusion of choice. The Quantified Self, the Internet of Things, the syncing of every possible gadget, the itch to upload, post and share links to our likes, friends, locations, tags of our existence in the cloud, were that much more appealing before the summer of Snowden. In revealing both the official language and range of N.S.A. data collection programs, Snowden’s leaks marked a radical change in how we think about privacy. Here, the glaze of technology was interrupted and a dormant debate received a critical update. Now tin-foil hats are in again and this preempted shift has been closely shadowed and catered to by the very industries anchored in the business of data. This means we can care about privacy without compromising our willingness to surveil ourselves, others, and our other selfies.

Certainly, with so many *known unknowns*,¹ post-Snowden, we write *as* Borges and we read *as* 1984’s Winston, untangling read/write permissions from the layers of invisibility of the state. How do I understand the value of data collection, its near mystic shroud of secrecy

¹ Secretary of Defense under President Ford and President Bush, the US ambassador to NATO under President Nixon, Donald Rumsfeld was celebrated and criticized for his system of knowns: the *known knowns*, the *unknown unknowns* and the *known unknowns*.

and its effect on anonymity, consent and democracy? The interpretation that is necessary to transform collected information into a narrative renders it a clumsy technique when used to accurately surveil. This embedded error, as it were, offers a new understanding of anonymity: to be everywhere is to be nowhere.

The Balcony is the Agora

The greek agora, the historic venue for assembly and market trade, is where we choose to be seen. This is not the private realm that has been de-prived of an audience;² it is in fact a place where we opt to have one. This adjusts the target of our concern from privacy to consent and in doing so, we substitute the violated space of the private/public for a space of potential anonymity— where a face is a crowd. Artist and activist Constant Dullaart calls this space the *balcony*:

The balcony is a gallery, balustrade, porch and stoop. The balcony is part of the Ecuadorian embassy. Itz masturbating on the balcony when your local dictator passes by. AFK, IRL, BRB and TTYS. The balcony is the Piratebay memo announcing they will keep up their services by way of drones, or just Piratbyran completely. Publishing in a 403, publishing inside the referring link, and as error on a server. Balconism is IRC, TOR and OTR. Bal-Kony 2012. Balcony is Speedshows, online performances, Telecomix, Anonymous, Occupy and maybe even Google automated cars (def. not glass tho btw). Balconization, not Balkanization. The balcony-scene creates community rather than commodity. Nothing is to be taken seriously.³

The gallery, balustrade and balcony, like the agora, forge a business model for the internet. This is no longer the sphere of de-privation since this is where information is exchanged. Any expectation of privacy in such a space is therefore complicated, irrational. In other words, “protection” is fictitious. There is no cloak but the cloak of invisibility— think Harry Potter, the Purdue Cloak,⁴ Optical Camouflage.⁵ This cloak can be worn, customized, hacked, traced and synced—it provides neither refuge nor relief from the prism of Things.⁶

Since it first began, the mission statement of The (Defense) Advanced Research Projects Agency, then known as ARPA, has been to “prevent strategic surprise⁷ from negatively impacting U.S. national security and create strategic surprise for U.S. adversaries by maintaining the technological superiority of the U.S. military.” The Eisenhower

² For Hannah Arendt, the private realm is de-prived of an audience.

³ Constant Dullaart, Balconism, Art Papers (March/ April 2014)

⁴ A team of researchers at Purdue University developed a data cloak that hides almost half of the time needed to transmit information via a fiber optic cable, meaning half of the what is being transmitted is basically rendered unreadable or invisible.

⁵ A more elaborate system that requires a person to wear a cloak made of retro-reflective material and a camera, a projector, a mirror and light are used to refract or bend light.

⁶ Richard Adhikari, Latest Wrinkle in Data Security: Time Cloaking, TechNewsWorld, (June 08, 2013) <http://www.technewsworld.com/story/Latest-Wrinkle-in-Data-Security-Time-Cloaking-78210.html> May 01, 2014

⁷ “The only thing that should be surprising is that we continue to be surprised.” Donald Rumsfeld, Rumsfeld’s Rules, <http://rumsfeld.com/> June 10, 2014

administration created ARPA in 1958 in response to the 1957 (surprise) launching of Sputnik 1. Adding the “D”(efense) to the agency validates its mission by incorporating the existence of an absolute threat.⁸ Now known as DARPA, some of the department’s work includes the development of ARPANET, a predecessor to the internet, a driverless car competition, Onion Routing (i.e. the TOR project), the Northrop Gunman Switchblade (an unmanned aerial vehicle, or drone), The Policy Analysis Market (part of the FutureMAP⁹ project, this was designed to be a market based off predictions of political outcomes in the Middle East)¹⁰ and the DARPA Shredder Challenge (a 2011 competition that rewarded the most accurate reconstruction of shredded documents).¹¹ While DARPA’s immediate focus may privilege technological advancement and superiority, its partner department IARPA, previously known as The Disruptive Technology Office, houses three offices: Smart Collection, Incisive Analysis and Safe and Secure Operations. The aim of the latter is to “dramatically improve the value of collected data from all sources” or, in other words, to develop a toolbox for economic espionage.¹²

In the agora, privacy re-emerges as a commodity in the form of email providers with servers overseas offering encrypted services for a fee, or as Firefox or Chrome plugins (Incognito, stealth mode, anonymoX, cryptocat, Duck Duck Go or even the Tor bundle). If the idea of the private online archive has been appealing to specific generations, its anti-archive companion has also been accounted for. Disposable platforms and burner culture (Snapchat, Meatspace,¹³ Blink,¹⁴ and others) offer a rehearsal of the untraceable presence online: they only perpetuate a fiction in the agora. The message is sent and then vanishes. This is more than a disappearing act performed on the message. It is a process by which the immediate anxiety that accompanies the releasing and entrusting of information is effectively diminished while still generating data.

Balcony privacy is no more than a buffer for what has been a more troubling matter of consent. Glenn Greenwald reminds us that the N.S.A.’s mission is to “erase all forms of privacy”¹⁵ and to “collect (including through clandestine means), process, analyze, produce, and disseminate signals intelligence information and data for foreign intelligence and

⁸ On DARPA’s official website, the agency announces their goal: In a video from their official website that promotes DARPA’s projects, the goal of the agency is announced: “In a world of ever changing international threats, DARPA provides technological ideas and innovation with people and projects ensuring the nation’s security.” <http://www.darpa.mil/About.aspx> March 18, 2014

⁹ Future Markets Applied to Prediction, FutureMAP, was a program meant to test prediction-based intelligence strategies. The “Saddam Security” Policy Analysis experiment aimed to see if decision-making could be informed by financial prediction and energy markets in real time. DARPA and its subset Total Information Awareness program created the Futures Market. It was never fully developed because Senator Ron Wyden and Byron L. Dorgan fought against its implementation.

¹⁰ Trading in Death, Congressional Record: (July 29, 2003) (Senate) Page S10082-S10083 <http://fas.org/sgp/congress/2003/s072903.html> August 12, 2014

¹¹ Puong Fei Yeh, Using Prediction Markets to Enhance US Intelligence Capabilities, A Standard & Poors 500 index for Intelligence (2006) <https://www.cia.gov/library/center-for-the-study-of-intelligence/csi-publications/csi-studies/studies/vol50no4/using-prediction-markets-to-enhance-us-intelligence-capabilities.html> June 06, 2014

¹² <http://www.iarpa.gov/> June 05, 2014

¹³ Meatspace is an ephemeral app that does not archive correspondences. The messages are limited to 250 characters and are accompanied by an animated GIF.

¹⁴ Blink is an app that allows users to send messages that are designed to self- destruct.

¹⁵ http://www.democracynow.org/2014/5/13/collect_it_all_glenn_greenwald_on, June 05, 2014

counterintelligence purposes to support national and departmental missions".¹⁶ The urgency of this charge is the affect of ideological warfare, the perpetual query of super powers for the magnificent *capacity* to surveil. Poverty, Drugs and Terror. Or the Cold War is King, given the U.S. military's confirmation of the Elizabethan doctrine of the King's two Bodies, which establishes by way of an effigy that a king's kingliness cannot die: *le Roi est mort; vive le Roi! le roi ne meurt jamais*. Proxies are a necessary condition for ideological wars and the war on terror cedes an inevitable subwar on privacy. Incestuous by nature, this war is subsumed by the state's dependency on corporate dataveillance in the form of economic espionage. While the threat looms beyond Google-drone-Glass vision, it has been calibrated to the illusion that this distance serves. A proxy is statecraft at work: this is an act that relies on our implication in a hypercapitalist exchange of information, a system that mobilizes us as products. Details about the PRISM program exposed the cooperation between major internet companies and the N.S.A. undermining the unquestioned necessity for Foreign Intelligence Surveillance. Corporate gain is imperative to war on the *terrace*,¹⁷ and content is currency.¹⁸

What would a super power be without a strong technological monoculture to support it? As a defense measure in our cyber cold war with China, we are warned that purchasing Chinese electronics is a high risk to national security: computers, hard drives, servers, smart phones etc, are surely bugged with entry points for Chinese hackers to gain valuable intelligence. The solution, of course, is to purchase American products. CISCO: the word is flesh. We cannot confirm nor can we deny CISCO's cooperation in the N.S.A.'s interception of purchased hardware as they are delivered to residences and businesses.¹⁹ Glenn Greenwald released a photograph initially part of a June 2010 internal newsletter authored by the chief of the N.S.A.'s Access and Target Development department that shows N.S.A. employees opening these intercepted CISCO shipping boxes to install spyware.²⁰ To confirm or deny is to delay; stall a delivery, install.

These are the intricacies of a technopticon, tools of war.

¹⁶ This is the mission statement of the N.S.A. as supported by executive order 12333 and can be found on the agency's official website <http://www.nsa.gov/about/mission/index.shtml> May 10, 2014

¹⁷ Terror & Privacy on the terrace: "Secret denunciations against anyone who will conceal favors and services or will collude to hide the true revenue from them." Text from a lion's mouth postbox in Doge's Palace, Venice, Italy.

¹⁸ Information regarding the PRISM program was leaked by Edward Snowden and published by Glenn Greenwald in The Guardian in 2013. These leaks It directly linked companies like Google, Apple, Facebook and Skype to the N.S.A.

¹⁹ In a panel discussion led by the ACLU at DefCon in Las Vegas, 2012, James Bamford highlights the difference between the dictionary's version of an 'intercept' and that of the N.S.A.'s manual of definitions and legal directives, the USSID 18: "an intercept doesn't actually take place until it is listened to."

²⁰ Erik Kain, Report: N.S.A. Intercepting Laptops Ordered Online, Installing Spyware (December 29, 2013) Forbes Magazine, <http://www.forbes.com/sites/erikkain/2013/12/29/report-nsa-intercepting-laptops-ordered-online-installing-spyware/> March 2, 2014



The opening of intercepted packages (left) and the installation of a beacon (right). These images were taken from an internal N.S.A. newsletter article. According to an N.S.A. manager "These devices are then re-packaged and placed back into transit to the original destination. All of this happens with the support of Intelligence Community partners and the technical wizards in TAO."²¹

Informative tangents:²²

On June 5, 2013, The Guardian published the first story about Edward Snowden's leaks, followed by a second story on June 6. On June 7, Obama was set to meet with Chinese President Xi Jinping to discuss Chinese cyber espionage and China's breach of US intellectual property. Derailed by the recent news, the discussion pivoted instead toward the raw exposure of Washington's surveillance tactics. This was a two-day summit held at Rancho Mirage where the Chinese delegation was scheduled to stay with Obama at the Sunnylands estate. (Un)surprisingly, President Xi Jinping rearranged overnight plans and opted for a downtown hotel instead.²³

(Think Temporary, Pop-up, Inflatable, Camp)

Example of state humor: the National Reconnaissance Office's octopus logo with the infamous slogan "Nothing is beyond our reach" adorned the spy satellite on mission NROL-39 in December 2013. State humor.²⁴ The NRO's mandate is to: "Develop. Acquire. Launch. Operate" and like the grip of an octopus, their position is "unwavering in our dedication to fulfilling our vision: Vigilance From Above."²⁵

(Think time-share travelling out of Orbit, Silicon Valley Riviera, a front-page balcony)

²¹ These images were taken from an N.S.A. publication and are now part of the public domain and can be found on https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:NSA_interception.jpg, attribution By NSA [Public domain], via Wikimedia Commons. They were originally published by Glenn Greenwald, courtesy of Edward Snowden's leaks, was released with his book *No Place To Hide*, Metropolitan Books (2014)

<https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Nsa-pwn-cisco.jpg>

²² They breed narrative.

²³ US-China summit ends with accord on all but cyber-espionage, Dan Roberts and Suzanne Goldenberg, *The Guardian* (June 9, 2013) <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/jun/09/us-china-summit-barack-obama-xi-jinping>, March 3, 2014

²⁴ NROL-39 is a satellite in the NRO's radar reconnaissance fleet.

²⁵ National Reconnaissance Office website, <http://www.nro.gov/about/index.html>



Mission patch of NROL-39.²⁶

A box intimates a beam and becomes a landing

Let us address the history of balconies for a moment. The word *balcony* is derived from the Italian *balco* and sourced from the Germanic *balko*, a beam.

The balcony is a pillar before being a landing. Structurally, it is an additive.

Broadly speaking, there are two kinds of balconies: the Maltese balcony and the balconet. A Maltese balcony extends outwards from the wall whereas the balconet does not. The roots of the Maltese balcony are first attributed to the Moorish occupation of Spain. The Alhambra Palace in Granada, built in the 9th century, was replete with balconies perched over its many gardens. This predates what we now refer to as the 'Maltese' balcony– enclosed wooden structures that extend outwards from the wall. Acknowledged²⁷ as one of the first of this style in Malta, the corner balcony of the Grand Master's Palace in Valletta (where the President of Malta holds office) was built in 1679 and spawned a flurry of wooden replicas in the 19th century, the now ubiquitous *gallariji* of Maltese urban landscape. From this *gallery*, the private sphere is no longer de-prived of an audience; its very structure is what allows it to have one.

²⁶ Image by Goran tek-en (Own work Based on; Blank globe Nrol-39) [CC-BY-SA-3.0 <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0>] via Wikimedia Commons July 4, 2014 https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Nothing_is_beyond_our_reach.svg

²⁷ The nominative genealogy of the Maltese balcony takes precedent over its (speculative) Arabic origin.



*Top: Kate and William on the balcony, April 29, 2011.²⁸
Bottom: Maltese balconies in Valletta, Malta.²⁹*

Directionally speaking, this balcony serves a pro-public address, cast toward the masses, or designated agora. The history of the White House Oval Office speeches imparts the gravity of the balconic address: George Washington's Bow Window is thought to be the antecedent to the Oval Office.³⁰ Washington, who never lived in the White House, annexed a two-story, semi-circular structure to the back of the President's House in Philadelphia. This was designed as a private/public zone— an inverted balcony of sorts where the President would greet visitors. At the beginning of congressional sessions, he used this space to ceremoniously receive the Senate and the House of Representatives. James Hoban, the architect who designed the White House, is thought to have used the Bow Window as a reference for the White House's Oval Office. John Adams and Thomas Jefferson continued Washington's Bow Window tradition by welcoming company in the oval office.

The Oval Office, however, is only used to make private/public speeches in dire circumstances. The first Oval Office Address was delivered by Harry S. Truman as an urgent request for Americans to conserve food in an attempt to assist postwar Europe. The first televised Oval Office speech was given by Dwight D. Eisenhower in 1957 announcing the deployment of U.S. troops in the Little Rock Crisis. On the night of the September 11 attacks, George W. Bush addressed the American people from this same office. The Oval Office

²⁸ Image by Robbie Dale (Flickr: Balcony entrance) [CC-BY-SA-2.0 (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/2.0>)], via Wikimedia Commons March 02, 2014 https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Balcony_wave.jpg

²⁹ Image by Leandro Neumann Ciuffo from Rio de Janeiro, Brazil (Maltese balconies - 3 Uploaded by russavia) [CC-BY-2.0 (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.0>)], via Wikimedia Commons March 02, 2014 https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Maltese_balconies_-_3_%288583029506%29.jpg

³⁰ Edward Lawler Jr., George Washington's Bow Window, A Lost Fragment of White House Precedence Comes to Light in Philadelphia, *The White House History* (2008) <http://www.ushistory.org/presidentshouse/news/whh0408.html> June 10, 2014

setting allows us to envision that the speech has interrupted a President at work.³¹ Used for more private receptions, the yellow oval room, also known as the Oval Parlor and Library, gives onto the Truman Balcony, overlooking the South lawn of the second floor of the White House's Executive Residence. So it is not the Oval Office, the place where the President is imagined to prepare his public agendas that leads to the Truman Balcony but the Yellow Oval Room, the parl-or, the library, a place to talk quietly among a trusted few. This is also where Truman would review his speeches with his wife before a balconic address, re-imagined here as a private view of the Bow from behind the ovalesque.

Informative tangents:

1. A street view of the Truman Balcony: On November 11, 2011, Oscar Ramiro Ortega-Hernandez fired at the White House with a semi-automatic assault rifle. One of the two bullets found on the property was recovered from a window frame on the Truman Balcony.³²

2. A watchtower: In an article called 'Obama's Way', written by Michael Lewis for Vanity Fair, Obama takes Lewis out onto the Truman Balcony: "Michelle and I come out here at night and just sit. It's the closest you can get to feeling outside. To feeling outside the bubble." [...] Obama pointed to the spot directly behind his head where the bullet struck."³³

3. A street view of a Maltese balcony turned Juliet (gutted): Soon after its completion, it was noted that the Truman Balcony somehow caused the rest of the White House to become structurally unsound.³⁴ To avoid demolishing the White House entirely, Truman proposed that it be rebuilt from the inside out, leaving its solid facade intact to conceal the renovation of its interior, or the emptying of its bowels.

³¹ Brendan Greenley, Why Obama Doesn't Give Speeches from the Oval Office, Bloomberg Businessweek (September 11, 2013) <http://www.businessweek.com/articles/2013-09-11/why-obama-doesnt-give-speeches-from-the-oval-office> June 02, 2014

³² Idaho Man Sentenced to 25 years in Prison for November 2011 Shooting at the White House, released from the U.S. Attorney's Office (March 31, 2011) [fbi.gov](http://www.fbi.gov), <http://www.fbi.gov/washingtondc/press-releases/2014/idaho-man-sentenced-to-25-years-in-prison-for-november-2011-shooting-at-the-white-house> June 15, 2014

³³ Michael Lewis, Obama's Way, Vanity Fair (October 2012) <http://www.vanityfair.com/politics/2012/10/michael-lewis-profile-barack-obama> June 15, 2014

³⁴ Truman Reconstruction 1948 - 1952, The White House Museum, <http://www.whitehousemuseum.org/special/renovation-1948.htm> June 15, 2014



Foundation of the bow window discovered at the George Washington's House in Philadelphia. Seen as a prototype for the Oval Office in the White House. The seal marks the spot where Washington would have received visitors.³⁵



Truman in the Oval Office of the White House, Nov. 7, 1951.³⁶

Obama has only used the Oval Office twice to broadcast. Instead, he uses the door and hall to the East Room, as the 'Public Audience Hall.' This is where he disclosed the death of Osama bin Laden. Journalist Brendan Greenley notes in his article *Why Obama Doesn't Give Speeches from the Oval Office*, "The East Room doorway setup looks like a press conference,

³⁵ Image by ushistory.org (2007) <http://www.ushistory.org/presidentshouse/plans/digbowwindow.htm> February 2, 2014

³⁶ Image by Abbie Rowe, National Archives and Records Administration. Office of Presidential Libraries. Harry S. Truman Library. (04/01/1985 -), via Wikimedia Commons May 13, 2014 https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File%3APhotograph_of_President_Truman_at_his_desk_in_the_Oval_Office%2C_posing_for_photographers_on_the_occasion_of_his..._-_NARA_-_200356.tif

and it has been used for that purpose in the past. The president is mic'd not at his chest, but at the podium; you get room tone, the echo of the hall. It looks and sounds like an open forum, a public appearance. Only there is no public."³⁷

A faux balcony is a two-way glass, a watchtower. The Patio of the Wrought Iron Grille was built on top of the southern wall of the Alhambra around 1655, significant because it only bears the appearance of a balcony. This is what we now refer to as a balconet or a Juliet balcony. It is a false balcony: it is inches away from its double entry doors that cannot open. For Julia: once a watchtower now in service of a clothesline.³⁸

This balcony is where an exchange takes place with the state;³⁹ close to transparent but not enough to be totally public (sur and sous) veiled by necessity. As any call and response so intimate in nature, the 'inmost' Juliet is suited to stage the eros of the polis in official garb and (ad)-dress.⁴⁰



Left: Juliet's balcony, Verona.⁴¹



Right: The White House during the Truman renovation, May 17, 1950.⁴²

³⁷ Brendan Greenley, Why Obama Doesn't Give Speeches from the Oval Office, Bloomberg Businessweek (September 11, 2013) <http://www.businessweek.com/articles/2013-09-11/why-obama-doesnt-give-speeches-from-the-oval-office> June 15, 2014

³⁸ In response to Donald Rumsfeld's use of Napoleon's quote on mistakes and blushing, Bonaparte also said that "The bold defiance of a woman is the certain sign of her shame –when she has once ceased to blush, it is because she has too much to blush for."

³⁹ The etiquette of conversation requires that a request be met by a promise.

⁴⁰ Intimate comes from the Latin 'intimus' meaning 'inmost'

⁴¹ Image by Vivaverdi (Own work) [CC-BY-SA-3.0 (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0/>)] via Wikimedia Commons June 1, 2014 https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Verona-Juliet%27s_balcony.jpg

⁴² Image by Abbie Rowe [Public domain], via Wikimedia Commons June 1, 2014 <https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Truman71-305-1.jpg>



Top: View of Martyr's square from a balcony where Qadhafi addressed crowds, February 17, 2012.⁴³
 Bottom: David Cameron and Barack Obama on the Truman Balcony viewed from below, 2010.⁴⁴

Intercept

An intercept⁴⁵ is to 'catch in passing'; its logical sequel involves a rupture, an interruption:⁴⁶

On January 23, 2014, around 4 am, Justin Bieber is arrested in Miami. When news breaks, Jane Harman⁴⁷ who had been invited to talk about the N.S.A. surveillance techniques on MSNBC, is proposing the N.S.A. "seriously consider not continuing section 215 and getting the ..." Andrea Mitchell interjects: "Congresswoman Harman, let me – let me interrupt you just for a moment, we got some breaking news out of Miami, stand by if you will. Right now in Miami Justin Bieber has been arrested on a number of charges. The judge is reading the charges, including

⁴³ Image by English: Foreign and Commonwealth Office (Flickr), via Wikimedia Commons June 08, 2014
https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:The_view_of_Martyrs%E2%80%99_Square_from_the_balcony_of_the_fort_%28from_where_Qadhafi_used_to_address_the_crowd%29_%286961717073%29.jpg

⁴⁴ Image by Chuck Kennedy [Public domain], via Wikimedia Commons May 28, 2014
https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:David_Cameron_and_Barack_Obama_on_the_Truman_Balcony_2010.jpg

⁴⁵ Intercept comes from the Latin *intercipere*, 'to seize in passing'.

⁴⁶ Interrupt presupposes an etymological breaking: *rumpere*, Latin for 'to break'.

⁴⁷ In 2009, the then congresswoman and representative of California's 36th district, held a conversation with an agent of the Israeli government that was intercepted by the N.S.A. She is said to have agreed to lobby the Justice Department to lessen the charges against two AIPAC employees in exchange for a shot at being chair of the Intelligence Committee. The N.S.A.'s transcripts of the recorded telephone exchange end with Harman saying: "This conversation does not exist."

*resisting arrest and driving under the influence. He's appearing now before the judge for his bond hearing. Let's watch."*⁴⁸

Interfect

If public privacy (as mediated by our relationship to technology) is in fact the new private, then our understanding and expectations of privacy should be responsive to its mediator. The immense coverage of selfie culture over the past two years surely indicates an official recognition of this cultural shift, demystifying our relation to the cryptopticon.⁴⁹ Recall the Total Information Awareness program. Part of the U.S. Information Awareness Office,⁵⁰ T.I.A. was launched in January of 2003, suspended by Congress in February of that same year, and renamed the Terrorism Information Awareness Program in May. The T.I.A. twins are both based on predictive policing and while these programs have been defunded, their mission and methods have been adopted by the N.S.A.

Google's mission is and has been to mine data. This is no secret: their mission statement is "to organize the world's information and make it universally accessible and useful."⁵¹ While T.I.A. is a government project and Google is a corporation, they structurally overlap. Intelligence agencies have *direct* access to corporate dataveillance. This was, as we know, first denied by the former CEO and current chairman of Google, Eric Schmidt, and later confirmed in the documents and slides leaked by Edward Snowden. More revealing is Schmidt's statement on the danger of an internet economy that is not a Google-run monoculture:

The real danger from the publicity about all of this is that other countries will begin to put very serious encryption—we use the term 'Balkanization' in general—to essentially split this Internet and that Internet is going to be much more country specific."⁵²

Bruce Schneier, cryptographer, privacy activist and writer, refers to surveillance as the business model of the internet. While he argues that the more effective course of action is legislative, he does insist that we should at least make our data more expensive by complicating its collection. The counter argument here is that this model of resistance only further sustains what he calls "the stalker economy". Our contradictory desire to sometimes preserve and other times perform privacy complicates the value of privacy while

⁴⁸ Government task force recommends NSA stop collecting phone records, (January 23, 2014) <http://www.msnbc.com/andrea-mitchell-reports/watch/new-nsa-recommendation-from-govt-task-force-125380163518> February 2, 2014

⁴⁹ In 2013, 'selfie' was added to the Oxford English dictionary.

⁵⁰ The Information Awareness Office was implemented by DARPA in January 2002 in response to the 9/11 attacks. The Total Information Awareness program was a product of this agency.

⁵¹ Google's website, <https://www.google.com/about/company/> March 20, 2014

⁵² Amanda Holpuch. Google's Eric Schmidt says government spying is 'the nature of our society', The Guardian, (September 13, 2013) <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/sep/13/eric-schmidt-google-nsa-surveillance> January 10, 2013

maintaining a demand for it. This is economic espionage.⁵³ Companies like Microsoft, Facebook and Google have been vocal about the damaging effect the N.S.A. scandals have had on their foreign client relationships. As Google lays down its own fiber optic cable, Eric Grosse, Google's security chief asserts the company's position on the state's interception of corporate data: "No hard feelings, but my job is to make their job hard."⁵⁴ It is thus not surprising that the N.S.A. refers to the agencies they provide information to as 'clients'.

Consider state surveillance to be a lesson in Borgesian narrative: using constant surveillance to enable the retroactive reconstruction of a person's life at any moment can be understood as a powerful tool for fabricating fiction. If the idea behind this forensic construction is to string together information from different pools of data in order to recreate a person, a profile, a life, we can easily understand this as only one possibility— of many. Tampering with the accuracy of the information we provide challenges the factuality of the interpretation of this data. If surveillance and counter surveillance mutually reward each other, how are we to envision possibilities that *protect but do not infect*?⁵⁵

This speaks to the stratification of a technopticon, a design of war.

OPSEC developer by day and cypherpunk vigilante by night: let us not forget that both Bill Binney and Edward Snowden were national security employees. When does pliancy become resilience? Trending elastic authority, Jim Sensenbrenner wrote and introduced the USA Freedom Act in 2013 as a counter measure to the notoriously controversial U.S. Patriot Act that he introduced in 2001.⁵⁶ This is the logic of the looking-glass, or at least a version of it: "Contrariwise," continued Tweedledee, "if it was so, it might be; and if it were so, it would be; but as it isn't, it ain't. That's logic."⁵⁷

When COINTELPRO, the notorious data collection operation was exposed, FBI director J. Edgar Hoover declared that going forward, all counterintelligence operations would be dealt with on a case-by-case basis.⁵⁸ This claim implies the illusion of a one-to-one ratio, of a perfect mirror image.⁵⁹ From this fiction, we draw tactics.

⁵³ Edward Snowden refers to economic spying in relation to the N.S.A.'s defense of an 'interest' instead of 'security'. Glenn Greenwald also calls the mode surveillance operates within economic. According to the reports that Greenwald has published, one of the mandates of the N.S.A. is to gain economic insight.

⁵⁴ David E. Sanger & Nicole Perlroth. Internet Giants Erect Barriers to Spy Agencies, (June 06, 2014) The New York Times, June 06, 2014

⁵⁵ Jacob Applebaum, To Protect and Infect, Chaos Communication Congress, Congress in Hamburg, Germany (December 28, 2013) <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vILAlhwUgIU>

⁵⁶ Sensenbrenner also supported the amendment of the Espionage Act of 1917- a federal law passed in that same year used to incriminate journalists and leakers such as Victor Berger, Joseph Franklin Rutherford, Julius and Ethel Rosenberg, Daniel Ellsberg, Chelsea Manning and Edward Snowden.

⁵⁷ Lewis Carroll, Alice in Wonderland & Through The Looking Glass

⁵⁸ COunter INTElligence PROgram was conducted by the FBI between 1956 and 1971. The program aimed to surveil, infiltrate, discredit, disrupt, and sabotage the work of political organizations such as the Civil Rights Movement, the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, the Rainbow Coalition, the American Indian Coalition, groups protesting the Vietnam War, the Ku Klux Klan and the Cuban Nationalist Movement. COINTELPRO also targeted individuals such as Martin Luther King Jr. and Albert Einstein. In 1971, the Citizens' Commission to Investigate the FBI broke into an FBI office and leaked information about the program to news sources.

⁵⁹ A particular type of mirror, called a 'corner reflector', redirects a shifted version of waves back to their source, as a modified replica. Balconies on high rises or tower blocks serve as acoustic corner reflectors, returning altered echoes.

Understanding our position as products in the agora of economic espionage mobilizes the creeping threat of non(linear)-sense: a single balcony used by many, a glass observation deck on the 103rd floor of the Willis Tower, IP address spoofing, onion routing, or the dispersion of incorrect personal information. Like the balcony, the agora serves as a public space in which possibilities can be exposed.

*On dispelling a techno monoculture imperative to the health of a secret state:
write as yourself reading Borges writing as Menard who writes as the Quixote to sprinkle
poison into the well.⁶⁰*

⁶⁰ Pierre Menard, Author of the Quixote is a short story by Jorge Luis Borges. Written as a review of Pierre Menard, a fictional 20th century French writer, the story explains how Menard recreates the 17th century Spanish Quixote by becoming the Quixote, a defiance of the limitations of translation.